



**#PlayYourPart**

---

# Judges' Report



**AWARDS 2017**

# Contents

- 01** Introduction
- 02** The judging panel
- 03** The judging process
- 04** Chair's foreword
- 05** Shortlist
- 06** Awards
- 08** Private Development of the Year - large (100+ units)
- 09** Private Development of the Year - medium (26 - 99 units)
- 11** Private Development of the Year - small (up to 25 units)
- 12** Affordable Housing Development of the Year
- 14** Family Home of the Year
- 15** Supporting Organisation of the Year
- 16** The Homes for Scotland Home Builder of the Year 2017
- 17** Sponsors

# Introduction

Now in its 15th year, our Awards scheme in 2017 built upon the refreshed and refocused format established in 2016 in order to ensure the programme remains the most robust and credible in the industry.

To achieve this, a feedback session for members with representatives of the judging panel was held on 17 August. Members involved in the original 2016 review were also canvassed for comments on criteria and process in September in order to inform finalisation of the 2017 scheme, categories for which comprised:

- ◆ **Private Development of the Year – large (100+ units)**
- ◆ **Private Development of the Year – medium (26-99 units)**
- ◆ **Private Development of the Year – small (up to 25 units)**
- ◆ **Affordable Housing Development of the Year**
- ◆ **Family Home of the Year**
- ◆ **Supporting Organisation of the Year**

All submissions were open to home builder, Registered Social Landlord and associate members with Home Builder of the Year decided by the independent judging panel following interviews with those shortlisted in the Private Development categories. These interviews with senior management covered areas such as customer and employee satisfaction, product design, health and safety, demonstrations of investment and growth, and other quality indicators. Interviews were also introduced this year for those shortlisted in the Supporting Organisation of the Year category.

# The judging panel

Our esteemed judging panel this year comprised:



**Kareen Davidson (Chair)**  
Former Sales & Marketing Director,  
Bett Homes



**Margaret Cumming**  
Former Managing Director,  
Miller Homes



**Nick Wright**  
Convenor,  
RTPI Scotland



**Ian Gilzean**  
Chief Architect,  
Scottish Government



**Malcolm MacLeod**  
Director Scotland,  
NHBC



**Linda Docherty**  
Immediate Past Chair,  
CML Scotland



**Douglas Read**  
Past President,  
RIAS



**David Stewart**  
Policy Lead,  
SFHA



**Stuart Tait**  
Manager,  
Clydeplan



**Jim Hayton**  
Former Policy Manager,  
ALACHO

# The judging process



The Awards were opened for entries on Monday 28 November 2016 with a closing date for submissions of Friday 27 January 2017.

A total of 54 entries were received with each judge assessing entries across several categories.

The judging process was based on the quality and content of submissions received. It was further supported by the use of scoring matrices to ensure consistency in assessment.

In addition, judges undertook site visits to all shortlisted entries in the Private Development and Affordable Housing Development of the Year categories. Home Builder of the Year interviews also took place with those shortlisted in the Private Development categories.

For the first time, interviews also took place with those shortlisted in the Supporting Organisation of the Year category.

The shortlisting process was completed on Friday 17 March, with awards and commendations agreed on Tuesday 25 April. Details were announced at the Homes for Scotland Annual Lunch & Awards ceremony on Friday 12 May.

# Chair's foreword

**“I can honestly say that it was very evident during the judging of this year's awards that innovative, good quality and well-built housing is definitely to the forefront in Scotland”.**

It was my privilege, for the second time, to Chair the Homes for Scotland (HFS) Annual Awards. Once again, the panel and I found the challenge both stimulating and extremely rewarding, and I would like to thank my fellow judges for their expertise and time which was so freely given. Their experience, knowledge and enthusiasm for the home building industry in Scotland proved invaluable in ensuring the judging process for these prestigious awards was carried out in a rigorous and robust manner.

Site visits and Home Builder of the Year interviews took place across the whole of Scotland - as far south as Galashiels and as far north as Inverness and Nairn. Whilst this was geographically challenging, it proved invaluable in showcasing the diversity of product being built and sold in this demanding market.

The entries, whilst down slightly from last year in number, were of a much improved quality. In the main, they excelled in design, photography and customer testimonials. This resulted in larger shortlists in most categories and it was a difficult decision to decide on the finalists.

With interviews held with finalists in the Supporting Organisation of the Year category for the first time, I would urge all HFS associate members to seize this great opportunity to demonstrate the important role they play in housing delivery.

What was apparent on the Private Development category site visits is that the shape of new housing in Scotland is changing. This is particularly evident in developments that have embraced the Designing Streets philosophy in terms of more encompassing road layouts, strategic landscaping and connectivity. We saw homes with distinct character, modern internal layouts and a good sense of community. The commercial success of these new homes was evident with strong sales and high customer satisfaction levels.

Representation was also high in the Affordable Housing Development category and the extended shortlist proves that stylish and energy-efficient affordable homes are creating popular communities. Again, it was an extremely difficult decision to decide on a “winner”.

It is refreshing to see that so many companies are focusing on a “customer first” approach. Customer satisfaction levels, audited both internally and externally, continue to meet and exceed the demands of customer expectations. This needs to remain the focus of the industry if the success of “new build” developments is to continue.

Comments by the judges in the individual categories show that improvement in more radical methods of construction, high energy-efficiency and considered placemaking is providing homes and places to live that people can be proud of.

It has been said before that “good standard stuff is just not good enough anymore”. I can honestly say that it was very evident during the judging of this year's awards that innovative, good quality and well-built housing is definitely to the forefront in Scotland.



**Kareen Davidson (Chair)**  
Former Sales & Marketing Director,  
Bett Homes

# Shortlist

The following list of shortlisted companies and individuals was announced on 23 March:

## Private Development of the Year – large (100+units)

- ◆ Barratt Homes  
*Ness Castle, Inverness*
- ◆ Persimmon Homes East Scotland  
*Melrose Gait, Galashiels*
- ◆ Springfield Properties  
*Meadow Lea, Nairn*
- ◆ Stewart Milne Homes Central Scotland  
*Earl's Green, Troon*

## Private Development of the Year – medium (26-99 units)

- ◆ Barratt Homes  
*Burnside @ Riverside Quarter, Aberdeen*
- ◆ CALA Homes (East)  
*Kinleith Mill, Edinburgh*
- ◆ CCG (Scotland)  
*The Schoolhouse, Edinburgh*
- ◆ Cruden Homes West  
*King's View, Glasgow*
- ◆ Places for People / EMA Architecture + Design  
*Urban Eden, Edinburgh*

## Private Development of the Year – small (up to 25 units)

- ◆ Mactaggart & Mickel Homes  
*Lockhart Woods, Edinburgh*
- ◆ Whiteburn Projects  
*Parkview Phase 3, Dundee*

## Affordable Housing Development of the Year

- ◆ Cruden Building & Renewals / Loretto Housing Association (part of the Wheatley Group)  
*Eriboll Crescent, Glasgow*
- ◆ Link Group  
*MacVicar Court, Oban*
- ◆ Lovell Partnerships / West Lothian Council  
*Housing for Older People, Broxburn*
- ◆ Places for People  
*Niddrie Mill Primary School, Edinburgh*
- ◆ Springfield Properties  
*Milton of Campsie, East Dunbartonshire*

## Family Home of the Year

- ◆ Barratt Homes  
*The Balmoral*
- ◆ Cruden Homes West  
*The Oak*
- ◆ Miller Homes  
*The Yeats*
- ◆ Springfield Properties  
*The Culbin*

## Supporting Organisation of the Year

- ◆ Geddes Consulting
- ◆ Registers of Scotland

Winners were announced at the Homes for Scotland Annual Lunch & Awards ceremony on Friday 12 May.

# Awards





## Private Development of the Year

Submissions across the Private Development categories were asked to demonstrate how they created high quality places for people to live in, while also measuring their commercial success. Key criteria assessed by the judging panel included contributions to the place-making and sustainability agendas as well as architectural design quality.



*Shortlisted developments included a spread of greenfield, urban and regeneration projects.*

# Private Development of the Year – large (100+ units)

Sponsored by

## Winner:

### **Stewart Milne Homes Central Scotland for Earl's Green, Troon**

In planning and constructing this 139 unit development, Stewart Milne Homes has focused greatly on the impact to the immediate and wider environment.

Well laid out with good street design, dedicated green space and aspects that strive to capture the local sea views from each home, this new community delivers a wide range of house types serving first time buyers and families. Testimonials from purchasers spoke highly of the positive environmental setting and the extent of green space within the development.

Not only has Earl's Green delivered much needed new homes to this part of Scotland, it has also enhanced the rural coasting setting within which it is placed and proven a commercial success with a very strong rate of sales.



# Private Development of the Year – medium (26 - 99 units)

Sponsored by

## Winner:

### **CALA Homes (East) for Kinleith Mill, Edinburgh**

CALA has made the most of this wonderful setting adjacent to the Water of Leith. A former paper mill, the site has been transformed into an outstanding development of 89 homes which acknowledges and draws inspiration from its historic use.

Influenced by a 'Designing Streets' approach to the masterplan, a mixture of well-proportioned house types with superb interiors are beautifully integrated into their surroundings. Material choices, build quality, careful landscaping and investment in new infrastructure have all contributed towards a great project which has a strong sense of place.



# Private Development of the Year – medium (26 - 99 units)

## Commendation:

### Places for People / EMA Architecture + Design for Urban Eden, Edinburgh

The 84 unit first phase of the Urban Eden project is an innovative redevelopment of a previously inaccessible urban brownfield site.

The design-led approach, drawing inspiration from the traditional Edinburgh 'colony' house-style, Urban Eden provides a great example of how a new community can be brought together on a difficult site with a clever mix of property types and price ranges.

A strong emphasis on the public realm, landscape and connectivity all contribute to an exemplary project in terms of place-making and delivery.



**ema**  
architects + masterplanners

places  
to people

# Private Development of the Year – small (up to 25 units)

Sponsored by

## Winner:

### Whiteburn Projects for Parkview Phase 3, Dundee

This 15 home brownfield development in the grounds of a B-listed former school demonstrates what can be achieved with a real focus on design excellence.

Distinctive and imaginative architecture responds well to the site, making the most of stunning views to the south across the Tay with those homes not benefitting from that view enjoying pleasant private courtyards.

The judges were impressed with how well the new properties integrate with the existing mature trees and complement, rather than compete with, the existing historic building.

Importantly, the judges felt that the lessons and value of good design which this sites displays are equally relevant to greenfield and hope that this award will encourage other smaller developers to enter this category in future.



**Whiteburn** projects

# Affordable Housing Development of the Year

Sponsored by

As well as demonstrating how the projects created high quality places to live, entries in this category were also asked how they contributed to the regeneration of local communities.

**Winner:**

**Lovell Partnerships / West Lothian Council for Housing for Older People, Broxburn**

This project on the site of a former primary school successfully addresses two significant challenges facing communities across Scotland – the need to provide housing for older people with social care needs and the challenge of regenerating and re-imagining town centres as use patterns change.

A worthy winner in the judges' eyes, the 18 home scheme turned the constraints of a steeply sloping site in a conservation area to its advantage with a contemporary design that fitted in with the character of the surrounding area.

The judges were particularly impressed with the high energy-efficiency standards of the development and the re-use of sandstone and slate roof tiles from the former school in the new building.



**LOVELL**

# Affordable Housing Development of the Year

**Commendation:****Link Group for MacVicar Court, Oban**

An early phase in a planned large mixed-tenure development that will have associated amenities and community facilities, MacVicar Court provides 25 high-quality, energy-efficient homes for social rent in Oban.

In addition to the use of a palette of colours that worked well in the stunning rural setting, the judges were impressed by the community benefits in terms of jobs and training that the development brought to the area.

Most of all, they liked the ambition demonstrated by the master plan proposals for the area which show a desire to provide much needed housing and support rural regeneration and wished to commend this vision.



# Family Home of the Year

Sponsored by

The challenges associated with getting on to the housing ladder are well documented but, in many cases, those wishing to move up the rungs in order to start a family or meet the needs of growing children can encounter just as much difficulty.

Recognising this, the focus of this year's Home of the Year category was on families. With no prescription as to price point or number of bedrooms, the onus was on builders to demonstrate why a particular house type would appeal to families and meet their requirements.

## Winner:

### Miller Homes for The Yeats

A four bedroom detached villa with integrated garage, The Yeats by Miller Homes satisfied all elements of the category criteria.

Its spacious kitchen/family/open plan layout across the full width of the rear of the property provides plenty of space for interaction and flexibility to meet the changing dynamic of family living.

The property also affords ample storage and the upper floor layout includes a Jack and Jill bathroom servicing two bedrooms which provides additional privacy whilst helping to limit stress in the morning – a boon for any growing family.

Even the integral garage can play an important role, whether for storage or an opportunity for more additional space.



millier homes



# Supporting Organisation of the Year

Sponsored by

Recognising the vital role that associate members play in delivering much needed homes as well as the value they add to the wider industry, associate and RSL members were invited to demonstrate how their organisation contributed either in relation to particular projects or best practice initiatives of benefit to the general housing sector.

**Winner:**  
**Registers of Scotland**

This submission outlined how Registers of Scotland (RoS) identified a critical title issue in the conveyancing of some new homes. Where this occurred, it was found to result in serious problems for purchasers obtaining clear title to their new home with consequent distress and financial loss to those affected and resultant bad publicity for the industry.

By setting up a dedicated internal team, then working in partnership with the industry, RoS developed its new Development Plan Approval (DPA) approach which ensures that any extant title issues are identified before the application stage for individual plots. DPA is free for use by any sized builder as often as they wish, with RoS handling registrations “end to end” for individual customers.

Measures of success are clearly evident. February to November 2016 saw a 67% increase in usage and over 400 developments have now gone through the process.

With testimonials confirming the effectiveness of the model, there is now the possibility that DPA or a similar check will become a mandatory component of the housing development process.



# Supporting Organisation of the Year

## **Commendation: Geddes Consulting**

Geddes Consulting is currently involved in the delivery of thousands of new homes throughout Scotland and the judges saw clear evidence of a multi-disciplinary, problem-solving approach to achieving successful planning outcomes for clients.

Collaborative working with the industry and local authorities alike was a clear hallmark of Geddes' approach, and the company's demonstrable track record and testimonials from satisfied clients evidence a successful organisation.

But for the exceptionally strong RoS submission, Geddes Consulting would have been a worthy winner which the judges wish to recognise accordingly.



geddesconsulting

# The Homes for Scotland Home Builder of the Year 2017



## BARRATT HOMES

Recognising the more rounded nature of this prestigious title, senior management representatives from all of the companies shortlisted in the Private Development categories were interviewed by the judges in relation to a wide range of issues including customer/employee satisfaction, product design, and health and safety.

Achieving a consistent 5 star builder rating and shortlisted in three categories (Private Development - Large, Private Development - Medium and Family Home of the Year) - Barratt really shone during the senior management interview process with judges unanimous in their decision.

With the presentation a real team effort, the judges were struck by the real pride and passion the staff had for their company as well as the strong commitment the company demonstrated to Scotland.

The importance Barratt places on its people was demonstrated by a 99.5% staff retention rate with judges particularly impressed by the Barratt training academy and employee share save scheme.

Barratt's community engagement approach was also considered outstanding and its environmental credentials illustrated by the fact that over 96 per cent of all construction waste is segregated and recycled.





With thanks to the following award sponsors:

Media partner

*improving living in scotland*



**Homes for Scotland**  
**5 New Mart Place**  
**Edinburgh**  
**EH14 1RW**

**Tel: 0131 455 8350**  
**Web: [www.homesforscotland.com](http://www.homesforscotland.com)**



**Follow us @H\_F\_S**